Use of Computational Tools to Support Planning and Policy

Johannes M. Bauer

Michigan State University

Quello Chair in Media and Information Policy IX. NIC.br Annual Workshop on Survey Methodology São Paolo, May 20-24, 2019

Four main messages

- 1. Information and communication policy faces grand challenges that require a dynamic systems approach to be addressed effectively
- 2. Big data analytics can contribute greatly to improve policy analysis, design, implementation, and monitoring
- 3. Because public policy often seeks to change the system it is interacting with, big data analytics also has limitations
- 4. Computational methods and integration with other types of social scientific analysis can help overcome these shortcomings

Plan for today

- Big data analytics and ICT policy
- Group discussion: succeeding in the race to advanced mobile broadband
- Application #1: Overcoming digital divides
- Application #2: Designing 5G markets to promote investment and innovation
- Application #3: Mitigating the power of digital platforms
- Recap and conclusion

Big data analytics and ICT policy

Grand challenges of information policy

- Increasing digital literacy and reducing digital inequalities
- Harnessing the benefits of next-generation technologies
 - Internet of Things (IoT), Internet in Everything
 - 5G wireless and ubiquitous connectivity
 - Robotics and pervasive automation
 - Big data analytics, machine learning, and artificial intelligence (AI)
- Development of culturally and socially sensitive, transparent algorithms
- Utilization of data while protecting sensitive data, privacy, and information security
- Mitigating the power of digital platforms without harming innovation

Big data and policy

- Two types of policy: improving the performance of a given system (incremental policy) versus policy aimed at changing the structure and trajectory of the system (architectural policy)
- Past behavior and policies may not be good predictors for the consequences of interventions. They also have limitations in deciding what <u>should</u> happen
- However, big data is invaluable in building models to analyze options
 - Scenario building and system dynamic models
 - Computational, numeric models
 - Agent-based models, evolutionary models, genetic learning algorithms
- Big data analysis is a complement to other methods and an important tool to improve policy design and implementation

Promises

- More accurate data documenting availability and adoption of ICTs
- Better understanding of ICT adoption, uses, and effects (e.g., Blumenstock et al., 2015)
- Design of efficient policy responses (e.g., Twitter data on urban commute data, cyber-physical systems in smart cities)
- Effective monitoring of policies
- Examples of projects collected at <u>https://unstats.un.org/bigdata/inv</u> <u>entory/</u>



Improved commute statistics using social media data in Jakarta

Concerns

- Big data may change the nature of "knowledge"
- Claims to objectivity and accuracy can be misleading
- Bigger data is not always better
- Data may lose its meaning if taken out of context
- Inherent biases of algorithms and machine learning
- Proprietary data and algorithms create new digital divides
- See boyd & Crawford (2012)

• COMPAS

- Widely used in U.S. courts since 2000
- Uses 137 features to determine risk of recidivism
- Close examination revealed strong biases against black men and in favor of white men
- Virginia Eubanks (2018)
 - Automating Inequality examined algorithms intended to support programs fighting homelessness, child abuse, and determine eligibility for public assistance
 - Case studies reveal that they create "digital poorhouses"

Types of big data analytical methods



Informing all stages of policy development



A digitally connected world

- Characteristics of our connected life
 - "Exponential technologies" accelerate diffusion and widespread use
 - Near-ubiquitous connectivity amplifies interdependencies in work, innovation, political movements, environment, ...)
 - As digital technology permeates nearly in all aspects of life and work, it increasingly becomes a "black box" for users (many features are hidden and/or unknown)
- A dynamic, adaptive system
 - Interdependencies create new non-linear dynamics (e.g., network effects, contagion, "butterfly effect")
 - Systems may have multiple equilibria ("attractors"), each representing different performance attributes
 - Initially small differences may lead to major differences in outcomes and path dependencies (e.g., Schelling, 1969, racial segregation model)
 - Diversity increases the performance and resilience of a system up to a point (but excessive diversity may eventually reduce them again)

Policy in dynamic adaptive systems

- The dominant view: public policy as control
 - Abba P. Lerner, The Economics of Control, Macmillan, 1944
 - Government can influence outcomes of economy to enhance welfare
- Governance: limits of the state, policy process, and policy-makers
 - Policy makers face many limitations such as incomplete information, feasibility constraints, self-interested players (e.g., Dixit, 1996)
 - Other forms of governance (e.g., networks such as IETF, IGF), voluntary coordination (e.g., 3GPP, W3C), and emergent norms are critically important
- Bottom-up policy for our connected world: active laissez-faire
 - Markets need appropriate rules and policies to work well
 - David Colander & Roland Kupers, Complexity and the Art of Public Policy, Princeton University Press, 2014

Many model-thinking (Page, 2018)

- Applying multiple lenses increases our understanding
- Examples include
 - Network models
 - Diffusion and contagion models
 - Game theoretical models
 - Path dependence models
 - System dynamic models
 - Threshold models with feedback
 - Collective action problems
 - Rugged-landscape models
- Can contribute to better policy



Transforming data into wisdom

From: Scott E. Page, *The Model Thinker, What You need to Know to Make Data Work for You,* New York: Basic Books, 20018, p. 7.

Group discussion

Succeeding in the race to advanced mobile broadband

Promises of advanced broadband

- Advanced broadband connectivity promises innovative services for consumers, support for the Internet of Things (IoT) and seamless specialized services for sectors such as manufacturing, transportation and health care
- Advanced wireless services (e.g., LTE, 5G) will constitute an integral part of the future gigabit communication network infrastructure. Its technical attributes, such as high bandwidth and low latency, will enable a wide range of innovations
- Worldwide, countries are positioning themselves to take advantage of 5G services but policy models vary widely from hands-off entrepreneurship (e.g., U.S.) to regulated competition (e.g., EU) to state-led rollout (e.g., China)

Concerns about infrastructure deployment

- High capital requirements (e.g., antennas, backhaul, spectrum, rights-ofway)
- High innovation potential but no clear use cases yet, hence revenue potential uncertain



Capex for wireless networks (2019-2020 estimated), based on GSMA market information

The Interamerican Advanced Wireless Task Force

- Founded to utilize big data to design effective policies for advanced wireless markets
- Hearing with major stakeholders (network operators, consumers, industry users, ...)
- All made recommendations on universal connectivity and which market design would be most conducive to achieve it

- Your tasks:
 - Review the handout and the recommendations by the player assigned to your group
 - Discuss the questions with your group
 - Write outcomes of your discussion on the posters
 - Determine one or more speakers who will share your findings with the other participants (if selected)

Approximate timeline

- Review the handout (5 minutes)
- Discuss the questions (10 minutes)
- Put your key points on the posters (5 minutes)
- Report back to all (10 minutes)

Application #1: Overcoming digital divides

The "homework gap" challenge

- "Homework gap" refers to disadvantages of students from kindergarten to high school (K-12) who do not have sufficient access to Internet connectivity and hence fall behind in school
- One of the digital divides
- Extent of problem is not well known, although there is reason to believe that existing data grossly underestimate it

Divergence between public data and actual uses



Source: https://www.govtech.com/biz/Microsoft-Speeds-Show-Broadband-Use-Is-Far-Lower-than-Access.html

Big data complemented by surveys

- Numerous initiatives to measure network speeds (e.g., Akamai, Ookla, ...), each with unique strengths and weaknesses, and examine their social and economic effects
- However, network access and quality is only one among many factors shaping digital divides
- Just examining network access/speeds samples on the dependent variable (does capture variations of access but not those without access)
- <u>Michigan Moonshot Project</u> (Merit Network + Quello Center + MLab)
 - Crowdsourced network quality data to overcome inaccuracies of existing, public domain broadband maps
 - Paper-based survey in schools across the state (pilot study in 202 classrooms in three school systems across the State of Michigan)
 - Allows granular understanding of problem and the targeting of remedial measures (e.g., subsidies, PPPs) to specific locations and populations
 - Unique ID allows linking information to other databases but numerous challenges to protect identity of participants

Survey in a box

Turnkey Kits

Leadership & Admin Introduction & Overview

Parental Letter

Teacher Instructions

- Video/lesson
- Paper in-Classroom survey (MSU)
- Homework Assignment Instructions (Merit)
- Student Key

Collection Instructions

Libbe deserves her non Ann san anner Annual					
 For each question, choose the one answer that best de questions, think about how you want to be compared to the provide the statement of the state	sofbes how YO how you are n	OU feel about ow. There an	yourself. Whe no right or w	n answering th ong answers -	e just
gve your recircon opinica.		Styre Chee	orbs Ellengrad	Agras	Agree
a. Lam happy with the way I can do most things.		5	0 0	0	0
 b. Leonatimes think Lama failure (a "loser"). c. Lam happy with myself as a person. 		-	8	8	ä
d Jam the kind of person I want to be		-		8	8
E I sto being pat the way I am.		9	8 8	8	8
 Fam as good a person as I want to be. I wash I had more to be proud of. 		6	S O	Ő.	0
not have thought a lot about some of these questions unsum about how to answer a question, please make 2) Which of the following BEST DESCRIBES what you m Madical professional (e.g., doctor, dentist, vol) Health professional (e.g., noning, pharmacy)	or you may no your best gues out want to be? O Science 1 Math lear	t have all of us. Your thou (select one) bacher chor	the information of the informati	on right now. If Important to u	you a
Biologiat Eadformerical scientist Autonomer Autonomer Chemist Physical Engineer Computer scientist Other scientist Other scientist Other scientist	O Other tee O Social so O Commun O Business O Lawyer O English/L O Farmer O Plumber, O Ollwr no	cher enfint (e.g., pr catione (e.g., parson anguage Arts electrician or -scence rela	wohologist, soo marketing, jour specialist another cruit o ted career	iologist) nalism, public reli r Izade	utions)
3) As things aland new how far in school do you think you	will not? (sele	of one i			
C Less than high school D Bachelor's de	1970-0 100		Don't know		
High school diploma or GED Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D.,	law degree, or o	Ever high leve	professional d	lagnas	
High school diploma or GED Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high	law degree, or o school? (select	ther high level all that apply	l professional d v)	lagnas	
 High school deplome or GED Master's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Enroit in an Associate's degree program in a two year community college or technical /reliate Enroit in a Bachelor's degree program in a college or university 	law degree, or o school? (select CO de CO Sta CO Sta CO Tra	Ever high level r eil that apply n the ermod s ta job rt a family vol	l professional d /) envices	lagnos	
 High school diploms or GED Hasker's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Enrol in an Associate's degree program in a two year commany college or schward installe Enrol in a Bachelor's degree program in a college or university Other a scenes or certificate in a cancer field Abled a registered appreviouship program 	iaw dagnee, or o school? (select CO doi CO doi CO doi CO doi Do Do Do Nor	Ever high level r all that apply n the armod s ta job rt a family vol volumisor or r tsum what yo	l professional d () anvices nissionary work u want to do	lagnos	
High school diploms or GED Hatker's degree Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Enroll in an Associate's degree program in a two-year community college or ischness i veffate Enroll in a Bacheler's degree program in a college or university Getern a scence or certificate in a concer field Abted a registered apprenticeship program Si To what extent do you see the following as harriers for you in furthering your education beyond high school?	law degrae, or o school? (select O 3o O 5e O 7e O 7e O 7e O 7e O No A Major Barnar	Prior high level t all that apply in the annexis is a job- et a family vid vid vid vid vid vid vid vid	I professional d P envices nissionary work u want to do Somewhat of a Bartier	A Relatively Minor Darner	Na Barr
High school diploms or GED Hatker's degree Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Enroll in an Associate's degree program in a two-yea community college or ischness / welface Enroll in an Eachelor's degree program in a college or university Getiern a iscense or certificate in a concer field Attend a registered apprenticeship program Si To what extent do you see the following as harmers for you in furthering your education beyond high school? A. Frends don't encourage it Determines don't encourage it	iaw dagme, or o school? (select o Joi o Ge o Do O Do O No A Major Banter	Ever high leve r eil that appi n the armed s r a job volariloer orn sum what yo A Significant Barrier	I professional d necion nissionary work u want to do I Semenhal of a Barter 8	A Retatively Bioor Sarner	No
High school diploma or GED Hatker's degree Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Enroll in an Associate's degree program in a two-year community college or ischness / welface Enroll in an Elacheler's degree program in a college or university Getern a locence or certificate in a concer field Attend a registered apprenticeship program Si To what extent do your see the following as harmers for you in furthering your education beyond high school? A _ Frends don't encourage it Permity obligations	iaw dagnee, or o school? (select O CO Jai O Da Sia O Do No A Major Banter O DO	Ever high level r eil that appl n the armed s r a job volarition orn some what yo A Significant Barrier	I professional d nincion nissionary work u want to do Sensethal of a Banter 000	A Relatively Blace Farther	Na GOOD
High school diplome or GED Associate's degree Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Enroll in an Associate's degree program in a two-year community college or ischness / welface Enroll in an Elachelor's degree program in a two-year community college or ischness / welface Enroll in a Blachelor's degree program in a college or university Cellern a locence or certificate in a concer field Attend a registered appreviolently program Si To what extent do you see the following as harriers for you in furthering your education beyond high school? A Frends don't encourage it Parmity obligations Will not pay off in long run Lack of elementbrotivation	law dagne, or o school? (select O O D Jni O O Da O Do Sa O No A Majer Santer O O O O	Ever high level t all that appl n the armed a La job vid videnteer or r tsum what yo A Significant Bastier	I professional d nivices nissionary work u want to do Seewwhat of a Barker 000000000000000000000000000000000000	A Relatively Bitsor Barter	a Bacoooo
High school diploms or GED Hanker's deg Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Ernot in an Associate's degree program in a two-yea commanity college or technical instate Ernot in an Associate's degree program in a two-yea conversally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college or universally Orbitm a loorne or carificate in a college Orbitm of loorne or carificate in a college Orbitm of loorne orbitm	law dagne, or o school? (select C C C D Joi C C Sia C D Sia C No A Major Banter C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C C	Ever high level t all that appl n the armed a La job vid videnteer or r tsum what yo A Significant Bastier	I professional d nervices nissionary work u want to do Somewhat of a Banker 000 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 00	A Relatively Network Server	a goodood
High school digioms or GED Hanker's deg Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Ernot in an Associate's degree program in a two-year orrmanity college or technical instatue Ernot in an Associate's degree program in a two-year orrmanity college or technical instatue Ernot in an Associate's degree program or a social as a dischalor's degree program or a social as a dischalor's degree program or a social as a dischalor's degree program order a mightened appreviously program Si To what extent do you see the following as harmers for pous in furthering your education beyond high school? A Friends don't encourage i Printly obligations Will not pay off in long run Lack of returnelshores you Not inswing what pots dont	aw dagne, or o school? (select 0 000 Ba 0 0 Ba 0 0 Ba 0 0 0 Ba 0 0 0 0 Ba 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	Ever high level t all that appl n the armed a La job vid videnticer or r tours what yo A Significant Bastier DOCOUNT	I professional d nervices nessionary work su want to do I Scenewhalt of a Banker DO DO DO DO DO DO DO DO DO DO	A Relatively Never Server	a anononon a s
 High school digioms or GED Masker's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Errori in an Associati's degree program in a two-year community college or technical instatue Errori in an Associati's degree program in a two-year community college or technical instatue Errori in a Bachelor's degree program in a college or university Others a learne or certificate in a college or university Others a learne or certificate in a college or program Sto what extent do you see the following as harners for you in furthering your education beyond high school? Prinds don't encourage it Prinds don't encourage it Prinds don't encourage it Prinds don't encourage it To what on the top too Not inverving what pote lacements available Will not pay off in long not To wrat of interpote ston. Not inverving what pote deat. Mercel is being sets deat. Mercel is the set of the set in the do Hear of yoing sets deat. Mercel is the set off. 	aw dagne, or o school? (select 0 000 Ba 0 00 Ba 0 0 00 Ba 0 0 0 0 No 8 anter 8 anter 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0	Ever high level t all that appl t all that appl t a job t a job vid vid A Significant Barrier 000000000000000000000000000000000000	I professional d nervices nessionary work su want to do I Scene what of a Banker 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 0	A Relatively Never Day for	annonono as
High school digioms or GED Manker's deg Associate's degree Ph.D., M.D., What do you plan to do during your first year after high Ernot in an Associate's degree program in a two-year commanity college or technical instatue Ernot in an Associate's degree program a Bachdor's degree program a college or university Chlori a loanee or carificate in a college or university Chlori a loanee or carificate in a college or university Chlori a loanee or carificate in a college or university Chlori a loanee or carificate in a college or university Chlori a loanee or carificate in a college or university Chlori a loanee or carificate in a conser fuld Abrefing your education beyond high school? A Frends don't encourage i Printly obligations Will not pay off in long run Lacro of loanee to abo Institute-freq you Chlori an oblig Wanter of page geb Rear of page geb dodt Method Loanee of loanee to Loane Litting deportants ansay from home	aw dagne, or o school? (select CCCCCCCC an CCCCCCCC an A Majer Benner CCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCCC	Ever high level t all that appl n the armed a t a job vid vid A Significant Bastier 000000000000000000000000000000000000	I professional d nervices nissionary work u want to do Scenewhat of a Banker 000 00 00 00 00 00 00 00 00	A Relatively Network Review	rianonninan a s

THE MICHIGAN MOONSHO1

MERIT'S COMMITMENT TO ENDING THE DIGITAL DIVIDE

merit





MLAB

More than 380,000 homes in rural Michigan do not have access to broadband. Accurate connectivity data is the first step in assessing community needs and building support for funding sources. Current FCC data aggregation processes may misrepresent broadband availability. These can be overcome by collecting consumer-sourced data through surveys such as this one.

The Measurement Lab (M-Lab) platform is run by the scientific community. We make all test results publicly available via the MeasurementLab.net website to help promote Internet research. M-Lab's Network Diagnostic Tool collects a number of measures of different facets of your Internet connection. The information published includes each device's IP address, but does not include personal identifying information about you as an Internet user.

Learn more about the Michigan Moonshot

+ Data Privacy FAQ

Where are you completing this survey from?

Including yourself, how many of those living in your home are under the age of 18?

Does your family own or rent the place where you live?

Do you have problems using the internet at home to do any of the following? (Check any that apply)

Homework (if applicable)

Contribution of big data analytics



Application #2: Designing 5G markets to promote investment and innovation

Enhanced Mobile Broadband



Communications

Promises of 5G connectivity

- Part of future seamless gigabit network infrastructure
- Enables numerous new services for consumers, businesses, government

Source: https://www.cablelabs.com /insights/cable-5g-wirelessenabler

Communications

The 5G value system



Can/should policy support 5G?

- Should access to network transportation services be regulated?
 - Mobile virtual network operator (MVNOs) access to MNO networks (e.g., regulated reference offer)
 - Access by application and service providers (ASPs) and content providers (CPs) to networks and end users (e.g., mobile network neutrality)
- Should public policy mitigate the market power of digital platforms and facilitate coordination among players?
 - Interoperability (e.g. open and transparent standards)
 - Open application programming interfaces (APIs)
- How should access to resources be organized?
 - Spectrum management (initial allocation, secondary markets)
 - Rights of way (outdoors antenna locations, access to buildings)
 - Data about network, users, ...
- How can public interest goals (e.g., universal coverage, service, public interest innovations) be supported?

Emerging 5G market designs

- Regulated competition (e.g., dominant in European countries)
 - Ex ante regulation to neutralize market power and dominance, typically after detailed examination of market structure and conduct
 - Might use backhaul regulation, mobile virtual network operator (MVNO) access, regulation of rights of way (ROW), network neutrality
- Policy-push (e.g., some Asian and a few European countries)
 - Proactive policy intervention to accelerate infrastructure rollout and service innovation
 - Typically includes infrastructure rollout targets (possibly public investment), mandatory MVNO access, open network provisions (e.g., mobile network neutrality, mandatory open APIs), open data, industrial policy programs
- Entrepreneurship (e.g., United States)
 - Strong reliance on private sector and entrepreneurship to advance 5G rollout and innovation
 - Minimal ex ante regulation and intervention; market failure to be addressed by competition policy (and possibly ex post regulation)

Complexity of non-linear dynamics



+ ... variables move in same direction, – ... variables move in opposite direction, +/– ... ambiguous

Positive and negative feedbacks



Regulation does not control, but "tune" the system



Granular data and scenario analysis allow exploring possible futures



Source: Batrouni et al. (2018)

Scenarios for 5G capex in the EU-14 and U.S.



Source: Bauer & Bohlin, 2018

Contributions and limits of big data analytics

- Contributes to building better models of the underlying non-linear dynamics
 - Establish directionality of relations
 - Calibrate effect sizes
 - Better and more accurate measures of outcomes
- Allows better monitoring of effects of policy changes
 - Provisions for data collection and data sharing needed (e.g., data trustees)
 - Needs to be complemented by analytical, causal models of underlying processes
- Can provide limited advice as to how policy changes will affect overall system and what the preferred course of action is

Application #3: Mitigating the power of digital platforms without harming innovation

Increasing concerns about platform power

- Economic and technological attributes of digital markets contribute to enormous market concentration
 - Supply-side economies of scale and economies of scope
 - Demand-side economies of scale (network effects)
 - Positive feedback effects in platform ecosystems
 - Winner-takes-all dynamics
- Concerns include
 - Ability to manipulate digital markets (e.g., design algorithms that favor own products/affiliated partners)
 - Increasing control over data that are not accessible to competitors (but an essential input to competitors)
 - Ability to influence and potentially manipulate information flows with broad effects on political system

Policies to mitigate platform power

- Network neutrality
 - Strict neutrality: each datagram needs to be treated alike ("a bit is a bit is a bit")
 - Weak neutrality: differentiation of quality of service (QoS) allowed, but needs to be done in non-discriminatory fashion
- Open network requirements
 - Interconnection and interoperability
 - Open data, open APIs, open algorithms
- Vertical (structural) separation
 - E.g., *Open Reach* in the United Kingdom
 - Platform providers (e.g., networks, providers of logical platforms) cannot also be present in applications, services, and content markets
- Competition policy measures
 - E.g., EU cases against Google; U.S. cases against Microsoft, Facebook
 - Often works slow and faces tremendous challenges producing compelling evidence

Contribution of computational methods

- All these policies generate differential, positive and negative feedback effects on players in the digital ecosystem (see above)
- Net effects depend on initial conditions, strength of interdependencies, and behavior of players
- Difficult, if not impossible to model analytically (non-linearities, multiple equilibria ("attractors"), fast-paced change)
- Some challenges can be overcome by computational methods
 - System dynamic simulation models (e.g., Sterman, 2000)
 - Generative social science, especially agent-based models (e.g., Epstein, 2006)

Agent-based modeling (ABM)

- Simulate the actions and dynamic interactions of agents (individuals, groups, organizations) with the goal to assess their effects on the system
- Components include
 - Agents that act based on rules (ranging from simple to rich specifications)
 - Relationships between the agents
 - An environment in which the agents interact
- Computational modeling frameworks (e.g., Swarm, NetLogo, RePast, AnyLogic) allow analyzing the emergent properties of such interactions
- Allow examining the consequence of changing the rules and/or structure
- Models need to be verified (testing whether the model works correctly) and valid (checking whether the right model has been built)
- Examples at http://ccl.northwestern.edu/netlogo/models/

ABM applied to vertical integration

- Kendall J. Koning, An agent model of vertical integration in telecommunications and content, Ph.D. Dissertation, 2017
- Models ICT value system as an interaction of heterogeneous agents (ISPs, consumers, content providers). Individual agents seek to optimize their profits (utility) following a decision heuristic and adapt their strategies based on the outcomes ("fitness")
- Over many generations, agent decisions improve and adapt to the parameter setting of the model, which include regulatory and policy dimensions (e.g., whether vertical integration is permitted, whether network neutrality is mandated) and economic/technical conditions
- Policy parameters and environmental settings can be mapped to outcomes

Overall model structure



The simplified agent model



- Consumers optimize utility
- Internet Service Providers (ISPs) and content producers optimize profits
- Regulatory variables
 - Structural separation (Y/N)
 - Bundling allowed (Y/N)
 - Zero rating allowed (Y/N)
 - Ability of ISPs to charge content providers (Y/N)
- Factorial design, model runs generate empirical data on outcomes

Relations among major variables



Source: Koning, 2017

Selected findings for market concentration



Source: Koning, 2017

Big data analytics and ABM

- Big data analytics can help to build better agent-based models
 - Calibration of effect sizes
 - Assessing the validity of model (e.g., by replicating outcomes using past data)
- Big data can improve monitoring of effects of policy changes
 - Provisions for data collection and data sharing needed (e.g., data trustees)
 - Needs to be complemented by analytical, causal models of underlying processes
- ABM allows evaluating potential effects of structural policy changes on overall system and in selecting a preferred course of action
- However, ABM needs considerable refinement before robust recommendations can be derived

Recap and conclusion

Recap of main points

- 1. Information and communication policy faces grand challenges that require a dynamic systems approach to be addressed effectively
- 2. Big data analytics is a promising tool that can help improve policy analysis, design, implementation, and monitoring
- 3. However, because policy often seeks to change the system it is interacting with, big data analytics has limitations
- 4. Computational methods and integration with other types of social scientific analysis can help overcome these shortcomings

Obrigado! Thank you!

References

- Batrouni, M., Bertaux, A., & Nicolle, C. (2018). Scenario analysis, from Big Data to black swan, *Computer Science Review, 28,* 131-139.
- Bauer, J. M., & Bohlin, E. (2018). *Roles and effects of access regulation in 5G markets*. East Lansing, Michigan; Gothenburg, Sweden. Available at SSRN http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3246177.
- Bauer, J. M., & Bohlin E. (2019). Horizontal and vertical regulation of 5G markets: Effects on investment and innovation. Work in progress, Michigan State University and Chalmers University.
- boyd, d., & Crawford, K. (2012). Critical questions for big data: Provocations for a cultural, technological, and scholarly phenomenon. *Information, Communication & Society, 15*(5), 662-679.
- Blumenstock, J. E., Cadamuro, G., & On, R. (2015). Predicting poverty and wealth from mobile phone metadata. *Science*, *350*(6264), 1073-1076.
- Colander, D., & Kupers, R. (2014). *Complexity and the art of public policy: solving society's problems from the bottom up*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Dixit, A. K. (1996). *The Making of Economic Policy: A Transaction Cost Politics Perspective*. Cambridge, US and London, UK: MIT Press.

References ...

- Epstein, J. M. (2006). *Generative social science: studies in agent-based computational modeling*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Eubanks, V. (2017). Automating inequality: How high-tech tools profile, police, and punish the poor. New York: St. Martin's Press.
- Koning, K. J. (2017). An agent model of vertical integration in tele-communications and content, Ph.D. Dissertation, Michigan State University, December 2017.
- Lerner, A. P. (1944). *The economics of control: principles of welfare economics*. New York: The Macmillan Co.
- Page, S. E. (2018). *The model thinker: What you need to know to make data work for you*. New York: Basic Books.
- Schelling, T. C. (1969). Models of segregation. *The American Economic Review, Papers and Proceedings*, 59(2), 488-493.
- Sivarajah, U., Kamal, M. M., Irani, Z., & Weerakkody, V. (2018). Critical analysis of Big Data challenges and analytical methods. *Journal of Business Research*, 70, 263-286.
- Sterman, J. D. (2000). *Business dynamics: Systems thinking and modeling for a complex world*. Boston, MA: McGraw-Hill.

Johannes M. Bauer

Quello Chair in Media and Information Policy Chairperson, Department of Media and Information Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI 48824, USA <u>bauerj@msu.edu</u> | <u>http://www.msu.edu/~bauerj</u> | @jm_bauer